

## Mid Semester Solutions : Q1 to Q3

Instructor: Sourav Chakraborty

Scribe: Anoop Kumar

1. From the definition of the asymptotic notations prove that if  $T(n) = aT(n/b) + O(n^c)$ , where  $c < \log_b a$  then

$$T(n) = \Theta(n^{\log_b a})$$

**Solution:**

Reference : Section 4.4 Introduction to algorithm : Cormen  
Under the assumption that  $n$  is an exact power of  $b > 1$

Let  $a \geq 1$   $b > 1$  and  $f(n) = O(n^c)$  &  $T(1) = \Theta(1)$

Iterating the recurrence,

$$\begin{aligned} T(n) &= f(n) + aT(n/b) \\ &= f(n) + af(n/b) + a^2T(n/b^2) \\ &= f(n) + af(n/b) + a^2f(n/b^2) + \dots + a^{\log_b n - 1}f(n/b^{\log_b n - 1}) + a^{\log_b n}T(1) \end{aligned}$$

Since  $a^{\log_b n} = n^{\log_b a}$ , the last term of the expression

$$a^{\log_b n}T(1) = \Theta(n^{\log_b a})$$

Using the boundary condition  $T(1) = \Theta(1)$ , the remaining terms can be expressed as the sum

$$g(n) = \sum_{j=0}^{\log_b n - 1} a^j f(n/b^j) \quad \dots(i)$$

$$\text{Thus, } T(n) = \Theta(n^{\log_b a}) + \sum_{j=0}^{\log_b n - 1} a^j f(n/b^j) \quad \dots(ii)$$

$$\text{Now, we have } f(n) = O(n^c) \implies f(n/b^j) = O((n/b^j)^c) \quad \dots(iii)$$

Substituting (iii) in (i) yields

$$g(n) = O\left(\sum_{j=0}^{\log_b n - 1} a^j (n/b^j)^c\right)$$

We bound the summation within the  $O$  notation by factoring out terms and simplifying, which leaves an increasing geometric series

$$\sum_{j=0}^{\log_b n - 1} a^j (n/b^j)^c = n^c \sum_{j=0}^{\log_b n - 1} \left(\frac{ab^{\log_b a - c}}{b^{\log_b a}}\right)^j$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&= n^c \sum_{j=0}^{\log_b n - 1} (b^{\log_b a - c})^j \\
&= n^c \sum_{j=0}^{\log_b n - 1} \left( \frac{b^{(\log_b a - c)(\log_b n) - 1}}{b^{\log_b a - c - 1}} \right)
\end{aligned}$$

Since  $b$  &  $(\log_b a - c)$  are constant, the last expression reduces to  $n^c O(n^{\log_b a - c}) = O(n^{\log_b a})$

which yields,  $g(n) = O(n^{\log_b a})$

Now, we use the bounds to evaluate equation (ii),

$$\begin{aligned}
T(n) &= \Theta(n^{\log_b a}) + O(n^{\log_b a}) \\
&= \Theta(n^{\log_b a})
\end{aligned}$$

**Hence proved.**

To prove above for any arbitrary integer  $n$  and not just restricted to be exact power of  $b$  extend our analysis to the situation in which floor and ceiling are used in the recurrence.

Obtaining a lower bound

$$T(n) = aT(\lceil n/b \rceil) + f(n)$$

and upper bound on

$$T(n) = aT(\lfloor n/b \rfloor) + f(n)$$

and lower bounding the recurrence is similar to upper bounding the recurrence, so we shall only present in this later bound

Iterating the recurrence we obtain,

$$T(n) = \Theta(n^{\log_b a}) + \sum_{j=0}^{\lfloor \log_b n \rfloor - 1} a^j f(n^j)$$

which is much the same as equation(ii), Now evaluate the summation

$$g(n) = \sum_{j=0}^{\lfloor \log_b n \rfloor - 1} a^j f(n_j)$$

in manner analogous to above proof and we have  $f(n) = \Theta(n^{\log_b a})$ . If we can show that  $f(n_j) = O\left(\frac{n}{a^j}\right)^c$  then we are done.

$$\begin{aligned}
f(n_j) &\leq d \left( \frac{n}{b_j} + \frac{b}{b-1} \right)^c \quad (\text{from finding } j \text{ element in the sequence}) \\
&\leq O\left(\frac{n}{a^j}\right)^c
\end{aligned}$$

2. Prove or Disprove the following set of asymptotic relations :

- (a)  $(2.9)^{\log_2 n} = \Theta(n^{\log_2 3})$
- (b)  $\log \log n = \Omega((\log \log \log n)^{\log \log \log n})$
- (c)  $n^4 \sim (1-1/n)^n n^3$
- (d)  $n^{10(\log \log n)^{100}} = \Theta((\log n)!)$
- (e)  $\log \binom{2n}{n} = o(n^n)$

**Solution:**

(a) We have  $(2.9)^{\log_2 n} = n^{\log_2(2.9)}$ . Since  $\log_2(2.9) \leq \log_2 3$ , so  $\frac{(2.9)^{\log_2 n}}{n^{\log_2 3}} = n^{\log_2(2.9) - \log_2 3}$  which tend to 0 as n goes to infinity.

So  $(2.9)^{\log_2 n} = o(n^{\log_2 3})$  and hence the given statement is not true.

(b) Let's take  $x = \log \log \log n$ .

Now,  $e^x = o(x^x) \forall$  increasing function  $x$ .

$$\therefore \log \log n = O((\log \log \log n)^{\log \log \log n})$$

Hence disproving the given statement.

(c) Let  $x = n^4$  and  $y = (1 - 1/n)^n n^3$

Then  $\log x = 4 \log n$  and  $\log y = n \log(1 - 1/n) + 3 \log n$

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\log y}{\log x} = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{n \log(1-1/n) + 3 \log n}{4 \log n} = \frac{3}{4}$$

Hence, they are not asymptotically equal.

(d) For the given statement to be true,  $\exists c \ni n^{10(\log \log n)^{100}} \leq c(\log n)!$  for all  $n < N_0$  for some  $N_0 \in \mathbb{N}$ .

Also since  $(\log n)! < (\log n)^{\log n}$  so for the given statement to be true,  $\exists c \ni n^{10(\log \log n)^{100}} \leq c(\log n)^{\log n}$  for all  $n > N_0$  for some  $N_0 \in \mathbb{N}$

$$\text{But } \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{n^{10(\log \log n)^{100}}}{(\log n)^{\log n}} = \infty$$

So, no such c exists, hence the given statement is false.

(e)  $\binom{2n}{n} = \frac{(2n)!}{n!n!} \sim \frac{4^n}{\sqrt{\pi n}}$  [Using Stirling's Approximation]

$$\text{Now, } \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\log \left( \frac{4^n}{\sqrt{\pi n}} \right)}{n^n} = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{n \log 4 - \frac{1}{2} \log(\pi n)}{n^n}$$

$$= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\log 4 - \frac{1}{2\pi n}}{n^n (\log n + 1)} \text{ [Using L'Hopital's Rule ]}$$

$$= 0$$

Hence the above statement is true.

**3. The Lucas Sequence 1, 3, 4, 7, 11, 18, 29, ... is defined by  $a_1 = 1$ ,  $a_2 = 3$ ,  $a_n = a_{n-1} + a_{n-2}$ . Prove that  $a_n = O(1.75^n)$ .**

**Solution:**

Given  $a_n = a_{n-1} + a_{n-2}$ ,  $\forall n \geq 3$   $a_1 = 1$ ,  $a_2 = 3$ .

Using generating functions to solve it,

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Define, } A(x) &= \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} a_i x^i \quad \dots(\text{i}) \\ &= x + 3x^2 + \sum_{i=3}^{\infty} a_i x^i \\ &= x + 3x^2 + \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} (a_{i-1} + a_{i-2}) x^i \\ &= x + 2x^2 + x \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} a_i x^i + x^2 \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} a_i x^i \\ &= x + 2x^2 + xA(x) + x^2A(x) \end{aligned}$$

$$\text{Therefore, } A(x) = -\frac{x+2x^2}{1-x-x^2} \quad \dots(\text{ii})$$

The roots of the denominator are  $\alpha = -\frac{1+\sqrt{5}}{2}$  and  $\beta = \frac{-1+\sqrt{5}}{2}$

$$\text{We can write } A(x) \text{ as } A(x) = -x\left(\frac{\gamma}{x-\alpha} + \frac{\delta}{x-\beta}\right) \quad \dots (\text{iii})$$

From (ii) & (iii) we get  $\gamma = 1$ ,  $\delta = 1$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} \therefore A(x) \text{ as } A(x) &= -x\left(\frac{1}{x-\alpha} + \frac{1}{x-\beta}\right) \\ &= -x\left\{\frac{1}{\alpha(-\beta x-1)} + \frac{1}{\beta(-\alpha x-1)}\right\} [\because \alpha\beta = 1] \\ &= x\left\{\frac{1}{\alpha(\beta x+1)} + \frac{1}{\beta(\alpha x+1)}\right\} \\ &= x\left\{\frac{1-x\beta+x^2\beta^2-x^3\beta^3+\dots}{\alpha} + \frac{1-x\alpha+x^2\alpha^2-x^3\alpha^3+\dots}{\beta}\right\} \quad \dots(\text{iv}) \end{aligned}$$

using binomial expansion of  $(1+x)^{-1}$

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{Equating (i) and (iv), we get } a_n &= \frac{(-\beta)^n}{\alpha} + \frac{(-\alpha)^n}{\beta} \\
&= \frac{(1-\sqrt{5})^n + (1+\sqrt{5})^n}{2^n} \\
&< \frac{(-1.236)^n + (3.236)^n}{2^n} \\
&< (0.168)^n \\
&< (1.618)^n \\
&< 2(1.618)^n \\
&< 2(1.75)^n
\end{aligned}$$

Hence ,  $a_n = O((1.75)^n)$

**Alternatively,**

Given  $a_1 = 1, a_2 = 1, a_n = a_{n-1} + a_{n-2}$ , we shall show,  $a_n \leq c(1.75)^n$

We proceed by induction on n,

Base Case :  $a_1 \leq c(1.75)$  ,  $a_2 \leq c(1.75)^2$  valid for  $c \geq 1$

Inductive hypothesis: We assume,  $a_i \leq c(1.75)^i$  For  $i \leq n-1$

$$\begin{aligned}
a_n &= a_{n-1} + a_{n-2} \\
&\leq c(1.75)^{n-1} + c(1.75)^{n-2} \\
&= c(1.75)^{n-2}(2.75) \\
&< c(1.75)^n \quad \text{for } c > 1.
\end{aligned}$$

Hence ,  $a_n = O((1.75)^n)$